

Annual Meeting of the General Faculty

Agenda

Monday, October 17, 2022

3:15 – 5:15 pm

Zoom

- 1. Welcome from Provost Kotz**
- 2. Report of the President**
- 3. Council on Institutional Priorities (CIPr)**
 - **VOTE** to approve permanent status of CIPr beginning FY24
- 4. OGFDC Updates**
 - **VOTE** to incorporate CIPr membership and functions
 - **VOTE** to update council membership term start and end dates
 - **VOTE** to approve incorporation of gender-neutral language
- 5. A&S Transformation Project Update**
 - Speaker: Elizabeth Smith, Dean of the Faculty
- 6. Introduction to House Communities**
 - Speakers: Janice McCabe and Craig Sutton, House Professors
- 7. Other Business**
- 8. Adjourn**

Draft August 17, 2022

Council on Institutional Priorities (CIPr) Charge & Membership

(ad hoc in FY21 and FY22; propose formal status in Fall FY23; to continue ad hoc for FY23)

Purpose: To formulate, articulate, and promote Dartmouth Faculty priorities in relation to the allocation of resources, the objectives on which resource allocation is based, and those commitments or expenditures that have significant budgetary effects. To participate in budgetary discussions concerning Dartmouth Faculty and the institution as a whole.

Functions:

1. To consult on administrative goals and institutional resource planning, by reviewing existing and preliminary budget and resource allocations over multiple fiscal years.
2. To meet with the President and Provost to discuss Dartmouth Faculty priorities within the larger context of institutional goals and budget allocations.
3. To meet with the deans of A&S, Tuck, Thayer, Geisel, Guarini, and the College to discuss needs of their constituent units and personnel.
4. To advise the President and Provost, form recommendations on all categories of the Central budget, including historical data and FTE numbers, and other recommendations as needed.
5. To make recommendations to the Provost on budgetary priorities for centrally-funded services that are shared across the institution.
6. To constitute, maintain, and oversee subcommittees as needed.
7. To consult with other councils and committees of the faculty as needed.
8. To submit a report to the General Faculty at the end of each academic year.

Membership: The Council on Institutional Priorities shall consist of the Provost (ex officio); the Executive Vice President (ex officio); the Chief Financial Officer (ex officio); four members of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences (including at least one member of the Committee on Priorities), and one faculty member from each of the professional and graduate schools (Tuck, Thayer, Geisel, and Guarini), serving staggered three-year terms. Faculty members will be chosen by the Deans of their respective units according to their respective governance procedures. The Chair of the Council will be a faculty member chosen by the Provost.

DARTMOUTH

ORGANIZATION OF THE GENERAL FACULTY OF DARTMOUTH COLLEGE

~~February 2022~~ October 2022



ORGANIZATION OF THE GENERAL FACULTY OF DARTMOUTH COLLEGE

THE CHARTER OF THE GENERAL FACULTY OF DARTMOUTH COLLEGE.....	3
A. <i>Definition</i>	3
B. <i>Meetings</i>	3
C. <i>Steering Committee</i>	3
1. <i>Membership</i>	3
2. <i>Functions</i>	4
D. <i>Councils</i>	4
1. <i>Council on Graduate Studies</i>	4
2. <i>Council on the Libraries</i>	5
3. <i>Council on Honorary Degrees</i>	5
4. <i>Council on Sponsored Activities</i>	5
5. <i>Council on Computing</i>	6
6. <i>Council on Benefits</i>	7
7. <i>Council on Undergraduate Research</i>	7
8. <i>Title IX Council</i>	8
9. <i>Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility</i>	8
APPENDIX.....	18
<i>Regulations for the Administration of Preferential Ballot</i>	18
1. <i>Elections by Preferential Ballot</i>	18
2. <i>First Stage Procedures and Eligibility</i>	18
3. <i>Second Stage</i>	18
4. <i>Tabulation of Ballots</i>	18



Organization of the General Faculty of Dartmouth College

I The Charter of the General Faculty of Dartmouth College

A *Definition*

As defined by the Board of Trustees, the General Faculty of Dartmouth College shall consist of the President, the Provost, the Faculty of Arts and Sciences, the Faculty of the Geisel School of Medicine, the Faculty of the Thayer School of Engineering, the Faculty of the Amos Tuck School of Business Administration, and such other persons as may be designated by the Board of Trustees to be members of the General Faculty. The Board may also designate members of the four separate Faculties, but each of these Faculties shall determine for its own membership qualifications to vote in its own meetings.¹

B *Meetings*

The General Faculty shall meet in October of each year to hear the President's report on the state of the College. It shall also meet at such other times as it is called by the President or its own Steering Committee (see Section C, page 2) to consider and take action on matters that may be placed on its agenda. In addition, the Steering Committee shall call a meeting of the General Faculty if asked to do so by a vote of two-thirds of those eligible to vote in any of the four constituent Faculties, or if petitioned to do so by seventy-five or more of the members of the General Faculty. Such a vote or petition must make clear the purpose of the proposed meeting of the General Faculty.

In meetings of the General Faculty all members shall have the right to vote. Resolutions passed by the General Faculty are advisory to but not binding on the four separate Faculties. The President shall be the presiding officer of the General Faculty; in ~~his or her~~*their* absence the Provost shall preside. The Steering Committee of the General Faculty shall be responsible for the minutes of the meetings of the General Faculty. These meetings shall be conducted according to the latest edition of Robert's *Rules of Order*. One hundred and fifty members of the General Faculty shall constitute a quorum.

C *The Steering Committee*

1 *Membership*

The Steering Committee shall consist of the President; the Provost; the Dean of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences; the Dean and one elected representative of each of the Faculties of medicine, engineering, and business administration; the Dean of the School of Graduate and Advanced Studies; and six members of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences, two from each Division. Three of these six members shall be appointed for three-year terms by the Committee on Organization and Policy, and three shall be selected by the Committee on Organization and Policy from its own membership. The President of the College shall be the Chair of the Steering Committee; in the absence of the President, the Provost shall serve as Chair. Newly elected and appointed members assume office on the first day of the summer term; those

¹ Information regarding the organization of the Faculties of the Arts and Sciences of Dartmouth College, the Geisel School of Medicine, the Thayer School of Engineering, and the Amos Tuck School of Business Administration is in the documents of the individual schools.



members chosen in a regular election or appointed for full three-year terms shall be ineligible to succeed themselves.

2 Functions

- a. To call meetings of the General Faculty upon its own initiative, or upon petition by members of the General Faculty as explained in Section B above.
- b. To set the agenda for all meetings of the General Faculty.
- c. To transmit all communications on behalf of the General Faculty.
- d. To establish and eliminate Committees of the General Faculty, and to appoint members thereto, to study and/or make recommendations on any matter of common concern to the faculties of this institution. Reports and recommendations from such committees are received by the Steering Committee, which may then submit them for deliberation and/or action to the General Faculty, a Council of the General Faculty, or the separate Faculties.
- e. To prepare and to distribute the minutes of the meetings of the General Faculty.
- f. To provide a continuous assessment of the organization, membership, functions, and purposes of the General Faculty and to propose such modifications as may be in accord with the responsibilities of the General Faculty of this institution. Any amendments of the charter of the General Faculty will become effective upon ratification by the separate faculties of arts and sciences, medicine, engineering, and business administration.

D Councils

The Councils of the General Faculty provide a forum for deliberation on matters of policy affecting the entire institution. They serve in a continuing advisory capacity to the President, the Provost and Board of Trustees, and report annually to the General Faculty. The President will appoint chairs of Councils normally from among the members who are not ex officio.

All faculty members of the Councils shall be elected or appointed for a period of three years. ~~Members elected or appointed during the spring assume office on the first day of the summer term; those members elected or appointed to full three-year terms shall be ineligible to succeed themselves. Memberships begin at the start of the fiscal year; retroactive start dates are permitted. Members may only serve a maximum of two consecutive terms for the same membership.~~ Council meetings shall be conducted according to the latest edition of Robert's *Rules of Order*.

1 COUNCIL ON GRADUATE STUDIES

a. Membership

The Council on Graduate Studies shall consist of the Dean of the Guarini School of Graduate and Advanced Studies, who will chair the council, the director (or designate) of each of the degree-granting graduate programs, one member from each of the Arts and Sciences (appointed by the Committee on Organization and Policy), Geisel, Thayer, and Tuck schools, and two graduate students.

The chair shall take the initiative in forming such special committees as are desirable for planning and coordinating interlocking interests of graduate programs with other activities of the various faculties, and with the responsibilities of existing committees of those faculties.

b. Functions

- (1) To recommend to the Dean of the Guarini School, the Provost, and the Trustees principles and policies governing all aspects of graduate education.



- (2) To review and approve proposals for graduate degree programs (PhD., M.S., and M.A.) and to forward them, with recommendation, to the Provost's Academic Planning Council. Council jurisdiction does not normally extend to professional degree programs which are the exclusive responsibility of the faculties of the Professional Schools.
- (3) To certify to the Trustees that candidates have met all requirements for the granting of graduate degrees.
- (4) To submit a report to the General Faculty at the end of each academic year.

2 COUNCIL ON THE LIBRARIES

a. Membership

The Council on the Libraries shall consist of the Dean of Libraries; the Provost or delegate; the Dean of College or delegate; the Dean of the Guarini School of Graduate and Advanced Studies or delegate; six members of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences (two from each division, from different departments, appointed by the Committee on Organization and Policy); one member from each of the three Professional Schools; three students (two undergraduates and one graduate); and one postdoctoral scholar. The Vice President of Information Technology serves as a non-voting member.

b. Functions

- (1) To represent the faculty and students in maintaining the excellence of the Library with respect to its collections, resources, services, programs, and spaces for the benefit of the Dartmouth community.
- (2) To assist in strategic planning for the Library by keeping the Dean of Libraries informed about current and future library needs for teaching, learning, and research, and providing liaison between the Dean of Libraries and the faculties of Dartmouth.
- (3) To advise the Dean of Libraries on formulation and implementation of policies and programs in relation to collection development and collection management, development of new library services and on other matters of general library policy.
- (4) To submit a report to the General Faculty at the end of each academic year.

3 COUNCIL ON HONORARY DEGREES

a. Membership

The Council on Honorary Degrees shall consist of three members of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences (one from each division) appointed by the Committee on Organization and Policy, and one member from each of the three Professional School faculties.

b. Functions

- (1) To represent the four faculties of the College in conference with the President and Trustees on the award of honorary degrees.
- (2) To cooperate with the Committee on Commencement in determining faculty participation at Commencement and on similar occasions.

4 COUNCIL ON SPONSORED ACTIVITIES

a. Membership



The Council on Sponsored Activities shall consist of the Provost, the Executive Vice President and Chief Financial Officer, the Director of Sponsored Projects, the General Counsel, the Deans of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences the three Professional Schools, and the School of Graduate and Advanced Studies, or their duly appointed representatives, and two members appointed by the Steering Committee from the faculties of the Professional Schools, and two members from the Faculty of Arts and Sciences delegated from the voting membership of the Committee on the Faculty. The chair shall be appointed by the President from among the members.

b. Functions

- (1) To propose and endorse internal policies regulating the activities sponsored by agencies outside the College.
- (2) To propose and endorse institutional positions in response to policies of external sponsoring agencies as they affect the College.
- (3) To review periodically the scope and impact of sponsored activities in relation to institutional purposes.
- (4) To propose and endorse institutional policies with regard to patents, copyrights, technology transfer, and the like.
- (5) To submit a report to the General Faculty at the end of each academic year.

5 COUNCIL ON COMPUTING

a. Membership

The Council on Computing shall consist of the Provost, the Dean of the Faculty, the Dean of the College, the Executive Vice President and Chief Financial Officer (or their representatives); the Vice President of Information Technology/Chief Information Officer, Librarian of the College; six members of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences (two from each division, from different departments) appointed by the Committee on Organization and Policy; one member from each of the three Professional School faculties; two undergraduate students and one graduate student.

Non-voting members of the Council shall include: the IT Directors from each of the three Professional Schools, three members from Computing Services representing support for Arts and Humanities, Social Sciences, and Sciences divisions, and the Director of Library User Services.

The Vice-President of Information Technology shall have the authority to form subcommittees as needed to provide advice on particular computing issues. Appointments of members of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences to such subcommittees shall be made by the Committee on Organization and Policy. All appointments to such subcommittees shall be for a one-year term which can be renewed.

b. Functions

- (1) To advise and consult with the VP/CIO on technology issues, services, standards, policies, and priorities that affect the faculty, students and staff of Dartmouth College.
- (2) To advise and consult with the VP/CIO on developing appropriate communication channels to Dartmouth faculty, students, and staff so that the Dartmouth constituencies are informed about information technology issues, and Computing Services has a variety of channels where concerns can be raised.
- (3) To advise the General Faculty, the officers of administration, and the Board of Trustees on questions of information technology policy.
- (4) To submit a report to the General Faculty at the end of each academic year.



6 COUNCIL ON BENEFITS

a. Membership

The Council on Benefits shall consist of four members of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences (one drawn from the voting membership of the Committee on Faculty and three appointed by the Committee on Organization and Policy), one member from the Faculty of the Tuck School, one member from the Faculty of the Thayer School, two members from the Faculty of the Geisel School, four representatives from exempt ranks and eight members from non-exempt and non-union service employee ranks. Members shall serve on the council for a term of three years, with the terms of service staggered. The chair shall be appointed by the President from among the members. The Vice President and Chief Human Resources Officer, or ~~his or her~~their representative, shall be a non-voting member and serve as staff to the council.

b. Functions

- (1) To review with the President policies and decision-making processes which bear on the benefits program at Dartmouth College.
- (2) To advise and consult with appropriate constituent groups on significant changes being contemplated well before the deadline for finalizing them.
- (3) To receive from the Office of Human Resources on at least an annual basis a report, complete with appropriate data and comparative information, regarding 1) responsiveness of the benefit plan to the needs of faculty and staff, 2) competitiveness with the plans of other institutions, and 3) cost effectiveness of Dartmouth's benefit plan.
- (4) To review and evaluate the College's employee benefits program and to make recommendations to the President with regard to the modification of existing employee benefit plans and the design of any new benefit programs
- (5) To submit a report to the General Faculty and other interested parties at the end of the academic year.

7 COUNCIL ON UNDERGRADUATE RESEARCH

a. Membership

The Council on Undergraduate Research shall consist of the Dean of Faculty or ~~his or her~~their representative, the Provost or ~~his or her~~their representative, the Assistant Dean of Faculty for Undergraduate Research, a member of the Committee on Instruction, six members of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences (at least one from each of the three divisions of the faculty and one from the interdisciplinary programs, no two from the same department or program, appointed by the Committee on Organization and Policy), and one member from each of the three professional schools.

b. Functions

- (1) To advise the Dean of Faculty's Office of Undergraduate Advising & Research on issues related to undergraduate research, undergraduate research programs, and campus-wide events at which undergraduates present their research.
- (2) To determine selection criteria for research programs administered by the Office of Undergraduate Advising & Research and to assist in selecting students for funding and for campus presentations as necessary.



- (3) To make undergraduate research opportunities and funding sources known to undergraduates and to keep faculty members informed about such opportunities and resources so that they may counsel and encourage students to make full use of them.
- (4) To act as an advisory body to faculty submitting grant proposals that involve undergraduate research.
- (5) To recommend to the General Faculty any major changes to the policies and procedures regarding undergraduate research at the college.
- (6) To submit a report to the General Faculty at the end of each academic year.

8 TITLE IX COUNCIL

a. Purpose

The Title IX Council consists of fair and impartial decision-makers who will conduct an objective evaluation of all relevant evidence, including both inculpatory or exculpatory evidence. From this Council, an Ad Hoc Hearing Committee ("AHHC") consisting of five (5) Faculty Members will be convened to adjudicate a formal resolution process under the Process for Resolving Reports Against Faculty.²

b. Membership

The Title IX Council shall consist of twenty-four members of the General Faculty, including fifteen members from the Faculty of Arts and Sciences and three members from each of the other three faculties, serving staggered three-year terms. Details about the selection of each school's members may be found in the organizational document for each of the respective Faculties. The chair shall be appointed by the President from among the members.

c. Functions

The Title IX Council was created as part of the Sexual and Gender-Based Misconduct Policy approved by the four faculties and the Board of Trustees in June 2019 and made effective September 1 of 2019. The Title IX Council and Ad Hoc Hearing Committee (AHHC) is charged with resolving reports of sexual misconduct against Faculty members.

All members of the Title IX Council will have received appropriate training to participate as informed and impartial decision-makers; this training will include the content provided to investigators, as well training on any technology to be used at a live hearing and on issues of relevance of questions and evidence, including questions about prior sexual history.

In a formal resolution process, the members of the Title IX Council chosen to constitute an Ad Hoc Hearing Committee are expected:

- (1) To provide all parties with an equitable opportunity to be heard.
- (2) To serve as a safeguard on the reliability and accuracy of the investigative process.
- (3) To give appropriate consideration to victim impact and mitigating factors.
- (4) To reach a full and fair determination of any sanction, should there be a finding of responsibility.

9 COUNCIL ON ACADEMIC FREEDOM AND RESPONSIBILITY

a. Membership

- (1) The Council will consist of eighteen members.

² <https://policies.dartmouth.edu/policy/dartmouth-college-process-resolving-reports-against-faculty>



- (2) Elections will be conducted annually in the winter term by a two-stage preferential ballot. Further details regarding the administration of Preferential Ballot voting may be found in the Appendix.
- (3) All full-time members of the General Faculty, including those on leave, will be eligible to vote in Council elections.
- (4) Five members of the Council will constitute the Panel for any case brought before it. Selection of the five Panel members shall be by drawing of lots. Upon challenge or withdrawal of Panel members, under rules set forth in Section 7 of the Agreement Concerning Academic Freedom, Tenure, and Responsibility of Faculty Members, alternate members of the Panel shall likewise be drawn by lot.
- (5) If the entire membership of the Council available for an individual case should be exhausted by voluntary withdrawals and/or challenges, the Council shall be replenished in the manner described in (2) for purposes of that case only.
- (6) The Council will have a secretary, to be appointed each spring from the membership of the Council by the President for a one-year term. The secretary will receive charges inaugurating Council proceedings, will supervise drawings by lot, will preside over any challenge procedures, and will record voluntary withdrawals by Council members.
- (7) After challenges and voluntary withdrawals are completed in any individual case, the five-member Panel which will hear that case will elect its own Panel chair.



Agreement Concerning Academic Freedom, Tenure, and Responsibility of Faculty Members Voted by the Board of Trustees (January 15, 1971) after approval by the Faculty (October 19, 1970) as amended June 12, 2009.³

1 The Trustees and Faculty of Dartmouth College agree that the principle of academic freedom is fundamental to the life and work of the institution and of all who serve it in the responsible performance of teaching and scholarly pursuits.

The Trustees and Faculty accept the principle of academic tenure as a means conducive to that independence of mind and speech essential to higher learning in a free society. Academic tenure is a status which presupposes rigorous, sustained, professional preparation and performance, and the obligation on the individual's part to work according to the spirit and methods of responsible inquiry and teaching.

2 Appointments and reappointments to the faculty shall ordinarily be made by the Trustees only after recommendation from the chairs of the departments concerned and the appropriate Deans.⁴ The precise terms of every appointment shall be stated in writing to the appointee by an officer of the College, acting on the authority of the President and the Trustees. All appointments shall be for either a specified period of time or with indefinite tenure.

a. Appointments and reappointments to positions above the grade of Instructor, excepting initial appointment as Assistant Professor, shall be made only after consultation with the appropriate committee of the several faculties.⁵ At the request of the Dean of the appropriate faculty, such consultation shall also take place in the event of a department's decision not to recommend reappointment.

³ As used in this agreement, "faculty" means, for the respective Faculties:

Arts and Sciences	All members holding tenure-track appointments as Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor, or Instructor (contingency appointments).
Geisel School	All members holding appointments as Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor, Instructor, or Lecturer in the Tenure-track/Tenure Line, Non-tenure Track Line, or the Academic Medical System Line. Voting rights for Geisel faculty members who are not employees of Dartmouth College are defined in the document entitled Academic Appointments, Promotions and Titles at the Geisel School of Medicine at Dartmouth College.
Thayer School	All members holding tenure-track appointments as Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor, or Instructor (contingency appointments).
Tuck School	Voting members of the faculty as defined in the Tuck School Faculty Handbook, as amended from time to time.

Except as specifically provided otherwise under Faculty rules, titles covered by the above definitions do not include prefixed ranks. (E.g., "Professor" does not include "Adjunct Professor.")

⁴ For purposes of this Section, "Dean" includes the Associate Dean(s) of the respective Faculties.

⁵ Arts and Sciences: Committee Advisory to the President

Geisel School: Appointments, Promotions and Titles Committee and the Dean's Academic Board

Thayer School: Committee on Tenure

Tuck School: Committee on Promotion and Tenure



- b. Decisions on promotion from the grade of Assistant Professor will ordinarily be made between the fourth and sixth year in that rank; this time may include service at another institution.
- c. Promotion into the rank of Associate Professor normally will be made with indefinite tenure. Under special circumstances, with specific approval of the Trustees, the Committee, and the individual, such appointments may be for a specified term. Initial appointments to the faculty in the rank of Associate Professor are normally for a specified term. Reappointment in this rank other than with indefinite tenure shall not be made unless specifically otherwise approved as above. [In the case of the Thayer School of Engineering and the Tuck School, appointments in the rank of Associate Professor are frequently for a definite term and on occasion are renewed without indefinite tenure. In Geisel, appointments in the rank of Associate Professor are for a definite term and may be renewed without awarding tenure.]
- d. Appointment or promotion to the grade of Professor shall normally be with indefinite tenure, but under exceptional circumstances may be for a limited term. [In Geisel, appointment, reappointment, or promotion to the grade of Professor may often be for a definite term.]

3 Except for adequate cause, as stated below, no member of the faculty of the grade of Instructor or above shall receive a notice that ~~he or she~~ they will not be reappointed less than six months before the terminal date of ~~his or her~~ their appointment; in the case of those faculty members who will have had at least three years' service in the College, one year's notice shall be given. At Geisel, one-year's notice will be provided to faculty members at the rank of Assistant Professor, Associate Professor and Professor who are employees of Dartmouth College in the Tenure-Track Line. Notice of non-renewal/termination for other faculty lines at Geisel follows provisions defined by those lines.

Members of the Faculty, recognizing the mutual equity in matters of appointment, accept the moral obligation not to ask release from their agreements under circumstances detrimental to the best interests of the College without according reasonable time for the College to make necessary readjustments.

4 If an academic appointee⁶ alleges that ~~his or her~~ their academic freedom has been violated, ~~he or she~~ they may request of the Dean of the appropriate faculty that the appropriate committee⁷ (hereafter, "the Committee"), and the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility in cases referred to the Council by the Committee, hear ~~his or her~~ their complaint and consider ~~his or her~~ their evidence pursuant to Sections 6(a)(iii) and 6(b)-(f).

⁶ For purposes of Sections 4 and 6, "academic appointee" means any person holding a teaching or research appointment.

⁷ For purposes of Sections 4-6, "Committee" means:

Arts and Sciences:	Review Committee
Geisel School:	Dean's Academic Board, or a subcommittee of the Dean's Academic Board
Thayer School:	Tenured members of the Committee on Conduct, Standards, and Conflict of Interest and/or Academic Directors who are not members of the Committee Advisory to the President or the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility.
Tuck School:	Committee on Academic Freedom and Responsibility



- 5 Both the Faculty and the Trustees acknowledge their obligation to uphold the standards of academic excellence and responsibility. Disciplinary action against a faculty member thus requires cooperation between the Faculty and the Trustees and may be effected by the College only for adequate cause.

To show the existence of adequate cause for disciplinary action requires demonstration of the unfitness of the faculty member either in ~~his or her~~their professional capacity or in ~~his or her~~their behavior as a member of the Dartmouth community. In order to protect academic freedom, while at the same time serving the interests of the College as a community, the following procedures will be used to determine whether adequate cause exists for any disciplinary action:

- a. Disciplinary action in the form of termination of an appointment with tenure, termination of a nontenured appointment before the end of its specified term, or suspension without pay from College duties (except temporary suspension under Section 6(d)) may be taken only by the Board of Trustees pursuant to the procedures set forth in Sections 6(a)(ii), and 6(b) – (f). All other forms of disciplinary action against a faculty member may be taken by the Dean, and the faculty member shall have the right to have such action reviewed pursuant to the procedures set forth in Sections 6(a)(i) and 6(b) – (f).
- b. Allegations that adequate cause exists for disciplinary action shall first be considered by the Dean of the appropriate faculty. The Dean, or representative thereof, shall discuss the allegations with the faculty member concerned. In considering whether adequate cause exists for disciplinary action and the nature of such action, the Dean may, in ~~his or her~~their discretion, consult with the General Counsel and/or an advisory panel of faculty members selected by the Dean.⁸ In matters involving alleged violation of the College non-discrimination policy, the Dean may also consult with the Director of Equal Employment Opportunity. Members of an advisory panel and other persons with whom the Dean consults shall meet the criteria stated in Section 7. All such discussions and consultations shall be confidential. If agreement on a mutually satisfactory disposition cannot be reached between the Dean and the faculty member, the Dean shall (i) in cases where the Dean recommends disciplinary action in the form of termination of an appointment with tenure, termination of a nontenured appointment before the end of its specified

⁸ Members of the advisory panel shall be selected from the following:

- | | |
|--------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Arts and Sciences: | Former associate deans of the faculty, former chairs of departments or programs, former members of the Committee on Organization and Policy, and former members of the Committee Advisory to the President, but not including current members of the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility. |
| Geisel School: | Members of the Appointments, Promotions and Titles Committee (excluding current members of the Dean’s Academic Board) and former members of the Dean’s Academic Board, but excluding current members of the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility. |
| Thayer School: | Tenured members of the Committee on Conduct, Standards and Conflicts of Interest, the directors of undergraduate and graduate studies, the director of the Master of Engineering Management program, and the senior associate dean, but not including current members of the Committee Advisory to the President or the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility. |
| Tuck School: | Members of the Committee on Promotion and Tenure (excluding current members of the Tuck School Committee on Academic Freedom and Responsibility) and former members of the Tuck School Committee on Academic Freedom and Responsibility, but not including current members of the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility. |



term, or suspension without pay from College duties (except temporary suspension under Section 6(c)) transmit the allegations to the appropriate Committee of ~~his or her~~their faculty⁹ pursuant to Section 6(a)(ii); or (ii) in all other cases, inform the faculty member of the disciplinary action taken by the Dean and the faculty member's right to have such action reviewed pursuant to Section 6(a)(i). In cases involving allegations against the Dean, the Dean's responsibilities hereunder shall be exercised by the Provost or, if the Provost does not meet the criteria of Section 7, by another person selected by the President who meets the criteria of Section 7.

6 This Section sets forth the procedures to be followed when the Dean takes or recommends disciplinary action pursuant to Section 5, or when an academic appointee alleges that ~~his or her~~their academic freedom has been violated pursuant to Section 4. Time limits set forth in Section 6(a) shall not include days between academic terms.

a. Committee Procedure:

(i) *Review of Dean's Disciplinary Action* - In cases where the Dean has taken disciplinary action under Section 5(a), the member of the faculty may request to have such action reconsidered, but only if one or more of the following criteria defining the grounds for reconsideration are met:

- The faculty member has new and material evidence that was not reasonably available to the faculty member or the Dean during the Dean's consideration and that would reasonably have affected the Dean's decision.
- The Dean materially failed to follow the procedures under the Agreement and the faculty member had called the error to the attention of the Dean or had reasonable grounds for not doing so.
- The Dean's action was arbitrary or capricious.

The burden shall be on the faculty member to prove the grounds for reconsideration.

The submission of a request for reconsideration shall stay the Dean's disciplinary action until the reconsideration request has been resolved.

The faculty member's request for reconsideration shall be made in writing to the Chair of the Committee within 15 days of the faculty member receiving notification of the Dean's decision. The request for reconsideration shall address how the request meets one or more of the criteria set forth above.

Within 30 days of receiving the faculty member's written request for reconsideration, the Committee shall conduct an initial review of the request.

- I. If, after initial review, the Committee finds that the request has not satisfied the criteria set forth above, it shall so advise the faculty member and the Dean, and the Dean's action shall stand.
- II. If, after initial review, the Committee finds that the request raises a substantial issue under the criteria set forth above, the Committee shall so advise the Dean, and the Dean may (but shall not be required to) respond in writing within 30 days.

If the Committee's initial review indicates that the faculty member's request for reconsideration raises a substantial issue, the Committee shall, within 75 days of the faculty member's initial request (and whether or not the Dean has elected to respond in writing), make a final decision on whether

⁹ See note 6.



the faculty member has demonstrated grounds for reconsideration, under the criteria set forth above. If the Committee finds that the faculty member has demonstrated grounds for reconsideration, the Committee shall return the case to the Dean for reconsideration with an explanation of the reason for the Committee's action; otherwise, the Committee shall notify the faculty member and the Dean that the Dean's action shall stand. If the Committee returns the case to the Dean for reconsideration, the Dean shall within 30 days either reaffirm or modify ~~his or her~~ their initial decision and report ~~his or her~~ their decision upon reconsideration to the faculty member and the Committee. The decision of the Dean upon reconsideration shall be final.

(ii) *Review of Dean's Recommendation in the most serious Disciplinary cases* - In cases where the Dean recommends termination of an appointment with tenure, termination of a nontenured appointment before the end of its specified term or suspension without pay from College duties (except temporary suspension under Section 6(d)), the Committee shall within 45 days examine the allegations supporting the recommendation in preliminary proceedings. If agreement with the faculty member on a satisfactory disposition is not reached and the Committee finds the evidence warrants, the Committee shall state the allegations with reasonable particularity, citing their sources and the reasons why, if the allegations are substantially true, they might constitute adequate cause for the recommended disciplinary action. This statement shall be transmitted to the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility for further action. If the Committee finds that the evidence does not support the action recommended by the Dean or that the allegations, if true, do not constitute adequate cause for the recommended disciplinary action, the Committee shall so inform the Dean and the faculty member and the Dean's recommendation shall not take effect. Such a decision by the Committee shall not preclude the Dean from taking disciplinary action other than termination of an appointment with tenure, termination of a nontenured appointment before the end of its specified term, or suspension without pay from the College, against the faculty member regarding the same matter that gave rise to the earlier recommendation, and such action shall be subject to review as described in Section 6(a)(i).

(iii) *Academic Freedom Cases* – In cases where an academic appointee alleges that ~~his or her~~ their academic freedom has been violated, the Committee shall, within 45 days, consider ~~his or her~~ their complaint and evidence. If agreement with the appointee on a mutually satisfactory disposition is not reached and the Committee finds the evidence warrants, the Committee shall refer the matter to the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility for further action. In such cases, the appointee shall act as complainant. If the Committee finds that the evidence does not support the appointee's allegation that ~~his or her~~ their academic freedom has been violated, it shall so inform the Dean and the appointee and the proceeding shall be concluded.

(iv) *Confidentiality; Conflicts of Interest* – Proceedings before the Committee shall be confidential. A member of the Committee who does not meet the criteria stated in Section 7 will ~~be removed~~ himself or herself from consideration of the case either at the request of one of the parties or on ~~his or her~~ their own initiative.

- b. A matter forwarded to the Council shall be referred to as a "case." Parties to Council cases shall be designated as follows:
- *Decision on Dean's Recommendation for Discipline* – In cases where the Dean has recommended discipline under Section 6(a)(ii), the Dean is the "Dean" or "complainant" and the faculty member is the "respondent."



- *Academic Freedom Cases* – Where an academic appointee alleges under Section 6(a)(iii) that ~~his or her~~ ~~their~~ academic freedom has been violated, the academic appointee is the “complainant” and the Dean is the “Dean” or “respondent.”
- c. Proceedings before the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility will begin with the Committee’s delivery of the case to the complainant, the respondent, and the Secretary of the Council. The Secretary, who is not eligible to be a panel member, will select a Panel, consisting of five members, chosen by lot from the Council. A member of the Council who does not meet the criteria stated in Section 7 will ~~be removed~~ ~~himself or herself~~ from the Panel either at the request of one of the parties or on ~~his or her~~ ~~their~~ own initiative. In addition, each party will have the right to remove a maximum of three Council members from a Panel without stated cause. A removed Panel member will be replaced by lot from the remaining members of the Council. A presiding member will be elected for each case by the Panel members from among themselves. During the proceedings, both parties and the Panel shall be permitted counsel and academic advisers of their choice. The Secretary is empowered to employ legal counsel to advise the Secretary and the Panel. With the consent of the parties, the Secretary may arrange for a mediator or arbitrator to meet with the parties in an attempt to resolve the conflict.
 - d. The Dean may temporarily suspend a faculty member, pending the outcome of proceedings under Section 6(a)(i) or 6(a)(ii), where in the Dean’s judgment such action is necessary to prevent the faculty member from inflicting harm on ~~himself or herself~~ ~~themselves~~ or others or from interfering with the proper conduct of College business. Salary and usual benefits will continue during this period of suspension.
 - e. The respondent will respond in writing to the Secretary of the Council within ten days of receiving ~~his or her~~ ~~their~~ copy of the complaint, either admitting or denying each particular allegation. Where a dispute exists in matters of fact, either party may request that the facts in the case be established by a board of three arbitrators, as provided in Chapter 542, New Hampshire R. S. A. (text attached hereto). Each party will choose one arbitrator, who will together appoint the third. The presiding member of the Panel has the responsibility and authority to frame the issues of fact to be determined after hearing each party with respect thereto. All facts, whether determined by a Panel or a board of arbitrators, must be established by a preponderance of the evidence. A preponderance of the evidence means proof by information that, compared with that opposing it, leads to conclusion that the fact at issue is more probably true than not. All findings of fact and the evidence and testimony on which the facts are established will be in writing and become part of the hearing record.
 - f. Hearings shall begin not earlier than twenty days and not later than forty days after the beginning of Council proceedings, except by agreement among the Panel and the parties. Where facts have been established by arbitration, hearings by the Panel shall begin not earlier than ten days and not later than thirty days following submission of the arbitrators' report. The hearings shall be open to the College community at the request of the respondent in cases under Section 6(a)(ii), or at the request of the complainant in cases under Section 6(a)(iii), although the Panel shall be permitted to close portions of such hearings or limit the number of observers, at its discretion. A verbatim record shall be kept and made available to both parties in the proceedings and to the Panel. The record of the proceedings may be made public only with the permission of the respondent in cases under Section 6(a)(ii), or at the request of the complainant in cases under Section 6(a)(iii), although the Panel may, or at the request of the President must, make public a full account of its findings and recommendations. Public pronouncements by members of the Panel, the parties, or the arbitrators, except for notices of hearing time and place, will be prohibited during the full course of the Council proceedings.
 - g. *Decision* –



(i) In cases under Section 6(a)(ii), the Panel will decide whether the facts, either agreed upon between the parties or determined by arbitration, constitute adequate cause for disciplinary action. In order to make this decision within the circumstances of the case, further testimony or statements, introduced by either party, shall be accepted if deemed pertinent by any Panel member. If the Panel finds that no adequate cause exists for disciplinary action it shall so state in its report to the President. If adequate cause is found, the Panel will recommend the appropriate action to be taken and report its findings and its recommendations to the President. The President will transmit the report of the Council Panel and the full transcript of the hearings to the Board of Trustees. Final action will be taken by the Trustees after reviewing the several documents.

(ii) In cases under Section 6(a)(iii), the Panel will transmit to the President, for ~~his or her~~their decision and appropriate action, the Panel's recommendation as to whether the facts, either agreed upon between the parties or determined by arbitration, constitute violation of the complainant's academic freedom.

h. Council proceedings shall be completed within 60 days after delivery of the case to the Secretary of the Council.

7. Reasonable precautions shall be taken to avoid bias and real or apparent conflicts of interest on the part of those involved in conducting proceedings hereunder. Specifically, reasonable steps shall be taken to ensure that members of Deans' advisory panels, review committees, the Council, and experts have no bias and no personal, professional or financial conflict of interest with respect to the parties or the case in question. In making this determination, consideration shall be given to whether the individual (or any members of ~~his or her~~their immediate family) has any of the following involvements with a party: kinship; assistance in preparation of a party's case; financial involvement; coauthor on a publication; collaborator or co-investigator; party to an academic controversy; supervisory or mentor relationship; other special relationship such as a close personal friendship or a physician/patient relationship. Consideration shall also be given to whether there is any other circumstance that might appear to compromise the individual's objectivity in reviewing the allegations. Parties shall have the right to comment on whether members of Deans' advisory panels, review committees, and the Council meet the above criteria. If a party makes a prompt, reasonable, objection to the Dean concerning a member of a Dean's advisory panel, or to the presiding officer concerning a member of a review committee or Council panel, the challenged person shall be replaced with another person who meets the stated criteria.¹⁰ If the objection concerns an asserted conflict on the part of a dean or presiding officer, the challenge shall be decided by the Provost or, if the Provost does not meet the stated criteria, by another person selected by the President who meets the stated criteria. The decision of the Dean, presiding officer, Provost, or other designated person, as the case may be, regarding such a challenge, shall be final.
8. Time limits hereunder for action by a Dean, Committee, or Council Panel, may be extended for good cause by the Dean or the presiding member of the Committee or Council Panel, respectively.
9. This agreement shall become effective immediately, following its approval by the Faculty and Trustees of Dartmouth College, superseding the agreement of September 1, 1960.

New Hampshire R.S.A.
CHAPTER 542
Arbitration of Disputes

¹⁰ Arts and Sciences: The process for replacing a member of the Review Committee is described in part III, subpart A.6.a. of the description of the membership of the Review Committee.



542:1 Validity of Arbitration Agreements.

A provision in any written contract to settle by arbitration a controversy thereafter arising out of such contract or an agreement in writing to submit to arbitration any controversy existing at the time of the agreement to submit shall be valid irrevocable and enforceable save upon such grounds as exist at law or in equity for the revocation of any contract. The provisions of this chapter shall not apply to any arbitration agreement between employers and employees, or between employers and associations of employees unless such agreement specifically provides that it shall be subject to the provisions of this chapter.

Sources: 1929, 147:1. RL 415:1. 1945, 191:1, eff. May 18, 1945.

542:4 Appointment of Arbitrators.

If no method of naming arbitrators be provided, or if for any other reason there shall be a lapse in the naming of arbitrators, then upon the application of either party to the controversy the court aforesaid or the court in and for the county in which the arbitration is to be held shall designate and appoint an arbitrator or arbitrators as the case may require, who shall act under the said agreement with the same force and effect as if he or they had been specifically named therein; and unless otherwise provided in the agreement, the arbitration shall be by a single arbitrator.

Sources: 1929, 147:1. RL 415:4.

542:5 Witnesses; .Summoning; Compelling Attendance.

When more than one arbitrator is agreed to, all the arbitrators shall sit at the hearing of the case unless, by consent in writing, all parties shall agree to proceed with the hearing with a less number. Any person may be summoned as provided in chapter 516, RSA, to attend before the arbitrators as a witness and the fees for such attendance shall be the same as the fees of witnesses in the superior court. If any person or persons so summoned to testify shall refuse or neglect to attend, upon petition the court in and for the county in which such arbitrators are sitting may compel the attendance of such person or persons before said arbitrator or arbitrators, or punish said person or persons for contempt in the same manner now provided in chapter 516.

Sources: 1929, 147:1. RL 415:5.



Appendix

Regulations for the Administration of Preferential Ballot.

ELECTIONS BY PREFERENTIAL BALLOT

The members of the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility (members and alternates) are elected by preferential ballot, every winter, involving all full-time voting members of the General Faculty, according to the following process.

1 ELIGIBILITY

All full-time voting members of the relevant Faculty, including those on leave, are eligible to be nominated for election to the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility, **except:** members who are known to be resigning or retiring at the end of the current year; or members who, as a result of leaves, off-campus teaching, or other reasons, are not scheduled to be on active service on campus during more than one term (fall, winter, and spring) of the coming year. Further details regarding eligibility may be found in the organizational document for each of the respective Faculties.

2 FIRST STAGE PROCEDURES AND ELIGIBILITY

The Registrar shall provide each voting member of the General Faculty access to a nomination ballot or ballots containing lists of all those eligible for nomination. The member shall select on this ballot (or these ballots) a simple choice for as many candidates as the instructions on the ballot shall indicate by the time specified (normally five weeks after the ballots are made available). The Registrar shall determine those candidates having the highest preference. The Registrar shall place the appropriate number of nominees on the ballots for the second stage. The appropriate number will normally be twenty-four for the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility.

2 SECOND STAGE

The Registrar should provide the second-stage ballot to the voting members of the General Faculty within three weeks after the due date of the first-stage ballot. Each voter will select and rank six of the names on the second-stage ballot. The six persons receiving the highest number of votes on the second-stage ballot will become members of the Council for a full three-year term. Vacancies on the Council will be filled by appointment in descending order of number of votes received by the first twelve persons on the most recent second-stage ballot. Further vacancies will be filled in the same manner from the next most recent second-stage ballot, and so forth, all such appointments to be valid only until the next year's elections. The above procedures will be modified if necessary, to ensure that all faculties are represented on the Council on Academic Freedom and Responsibility.

3 TABULATION OF BALLOTS

Any ballot that does not conform to the instructions for voting shall be declared invalid. In the ranking of candidates on a ranked-choice ballot, the preference numbers 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, shall count 6, 5, 4, 3, 2, 1 points respectively (assuming, for example, that six nominees are to be chosen), the candidates being ranked in the order of the total number of points they receive. In case of a tie in either stage, preference shall be given to the candidate having the larger number of preference



numbers 1; in case a tie still exists, the preference numbers 2 shall be used, and so on; in case the tie is absolute, the President shall cast the deciding vote.

